

*Readings “anassāsiṃ” and “panassassaṃ”*  
**in SN IV para.71-73**

Chakrit LAEMMUANG

# *Readings “anassāsiṃ” and “panassassaṃ”* in SN IV para.71-73

1. Context and Translation
2. Variant Reading
3. Commentary
4. Etymology
5. Some remarks

# “*anassāsīṃ*” and “*panassassam*” in SN IV para.71-73

## 1. Context in Printed Editions and English Translation

1.1 These readings occur in a sentence “**etthāhaṃ bhante anassāsīṃ / panassassam**”.

1.2 First problem: readings “*anassāsīṃ*” and “*panassāsam*” don’t appear together in some places and some editions.

Reading “*anassāsīṃ/ anassāsam/ anassasam*” = **a**;

“*panassassam/ panassasam/ panassāsam*” = **p**

# “*anassāsiṃ*” and “*panassassaṃ*” in SN IV para.71-73

Edition	para.		
	71	72	73
B <sup>e</sup>	a	a p	a p
C <sup>e</sup>	a	a	p
E <sup>e</sup>	a	a	a
S <sup>e</sup>	a	p	p

“*etthāhaṃ bhante anassāsiṃ / panassassaṃ*”

## 1.3 Translation

- Bhikkhu Bodhi: “Here, venerable sir, I am **lost**.”
- F.L. Woodward (PTS): “Herein, lord, I am **in despair**.”

# “*anassāsīm*” and “*panassassam*” in SN IV para.71-73

## 2. Variant Reading

### 2.1 para.71

Variant	B	C	K	T	MSS	Eds	Comm.
^			K20		1		
anassa		C04			1		
anassasaṃ	B19				1	Be	Bce
anassassaṃ	B18.B20				2		
anassāsa			K22		1		
anassāsaṃ	B16.B17		K17.K18.K19.K21		6	Se	Sc
anassāsīm		C03			1	Ce.Ee	Cce,Ece
anassāsī		C01.C02			2		
anassāyi		C05			1		
anissāsaṃ				T12	1		
a{na}ssāsaṃ				T10	1		
ssā<-haṃ>saṃ				T11.T14	2		
{ssasaṃ}				T13	1		

# para.71

	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsīm	ahañ	hi	bhante
B16	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsam	aham	^	bhante
B17	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsam	aham	^	bhante
B18	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassassam	aham	hi	bhante
B19	aññataro	bhikkhū	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam	ahaññ	hi	bhante
B20	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassassam	ahañ	hi	bhante
Be	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam	aham	hi	bhante
C01	añña {ta}ro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsī	ahañ	hi	bhante
C02	aññataro	bhikkhu	bha<ga>vantam	etadavoca	ettāham	bhante	anassāsī	ahamña	hi	bhante
C03	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	e<-da>tadavoca	e {tthā}ham	bhante	anassāsīm	ahañ	hi	bhante
C04	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassa	ahañ	hi	bhante
C05	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāyi	aham<-ña>	hi	bhante
Ce	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsīm	ahañ	hi	bhante
Ee	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsīm	ahañ	hi	bhante
K17	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāhiham	bhante	anassāsam	aham	hi	bhante
K18	añña {ta}ro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsam	a {ham}	hi	bhante
K19	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsam	aham	hi	bhante
K20	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^
K21	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsam	aham	hi	bhante
K22	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsa	ahañā	hi	bhante
Se	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsam	aham	hi	bhante
T10	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	{bha}nte	a {na}ssāsam	ahañ	hi	bhante
T11	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	ssā<-ham>sam	ahañ	hi	bhante
T12	aññattaro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anissāsam	ahañ	hi	bhante
T13	aññattaro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	{ssasam}	<+bharañ>	<+hi>	<+bhante>
T14	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhaggavantam	etaddavoca	etthaham	bhante	ssā<-ham>sam	han	{hi}	bhante



# “*anassāsim*” and “*panassassam*” in SN IV para.71-73

## 2. Variant Reading

### 2.2 para.72

Variant ↓	B	C	K	T	MSS ↓	Eds	Comm.
^ ^			K17.K20.K21		3		
^ manassassam	B20				1		
^ manassisam			K18.K19		2		
^ panassasam	B19				1		
^ panassāsam						Se	Scē
anappāsam etthāham bhante passāsam				T10.T12	2		
anapāpam etthaham bhante panasā<->sa				T13	1		
anapāpam etthāham bhante panassāsa				T11	1		
anapāpam etthāham bhante passāsam				T14	1		
anassasam panassasam						Be	
anassassam ^	B18				1		
anassāsam ^	B16.B17		K22		3		
anassāsim ^		C01.C02.C04.C05			4	Ce.Ee	Cce ,Ece
ana {ssa} sim ^		C03			1		

# para.72



	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam panassasam	ahañ	hi	bhante
B16	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam ^	aham	hi	bhante
B17	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthātam	bhante	anassasam ^	aham	hi	bhante
B18	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam ^	aham	hi	bhante
B19	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	^ panassasam	aham	hi	bhante
B20	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	^ manassasam	aham	hi	bhante
Be	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam panassasam	aham	hi	bhante
C01	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	<->etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasim ^	a{hañ}	hi	bhante
C02	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasim ^	abhiñña	hi	bhante
C03	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	ana{ssa}sim ^	ahañ	hi	bhante
C04	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasim ^	ahañ	hi	bhante
C05	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasim ^	a{ham}	hi	bhante
Ce	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasim ^	ahañ	hi	bhante
Ee	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasim ^	ahañ	hi	bhante
K17	^	^	^	^	^	^	^ ^	^	^	^
K18	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	^ manassisam	aham	hi	bhante
K19	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	^ manassisam	aham	hi	bhante
K20	^	^	^	^	^	^	^ ^	^	^	^
K21	^	^	^	^	^	^	^ ^	^	^	^
K22	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasam ^	ahamña	hi	bhante
Se	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	^ panassasam	aham	hi	bhante
T10	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anappasam etthāham bhante passasam	aham	hi	bhante
T11	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bha<+ga>vantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anapāpam etthāham bhante panassasa	aham	hi	bhante
T12	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anappasam etthāham bhante passasam	aham	hi	bhante
T13	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāha	bhante	anapāpam etthāham bhante panasā<->sa	aham	hi	bhante
T14	aññatāro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadvoca	etthāham	bhante	anapāpam etthā ham bhante passasam	aham	hi cha	bhante



# “*anassāsiṃ*” and “*panassassam*” in SN IV para.71-73

## 2. Variant Reading

### 2.3 para.73 reading a

Variant 	B	C	K	T	MSS 	Eds	Comm.
^	B16.B17		K18.K19.K20		5	Ce.Se	
anassasaṃ	B19				1	Be	Bce
anassassam	B18.B20				2		
anassānaṃ		C01.C02			2		
anassāsaṃ			K17.K21		2		Sc
anassāsaṃ etthā bhante anassāsaṃ etthāhaṃ bhante				T14	1		
anassāsaṃ etthāhaṃ bhante				T10.T11.T12	3		
anassāsiṃ		C04			1	Ee	
anassātaṃ		C03.C05			2		
anassāya			K22		1		
anā {sā} yaṃ etthahaṃ bhante				T13	1		

## 2. Variant Reading

### 2.3 para.73 reading p

Variant ↓	B	C	K	T	MSS ↓	Eds	Comm.
...la...			K22		1		
...pe...		C01.C02.C03.C04.C05			5		
^	B16.B17		K17.K20.K21		5	Ee	
manassāsaṃ			K19		1		
manussassaṃ	B18				1		
panassasaṃ						Be	Bce
panassassaṃ	B20				1	Ce	Cce,Ece
panassassi	B19				1		
panassāsaṃ						Se	Scce
passasaṃ				T10.T12.T13	3		
passāsaṃ				T11	1		
{ma}nassāsaṃ			K18		1		
{pa}ssasaṃ				T14	1		

# para.73

	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsīṃ	panassassaṃ	ahañ	hi	bhante
B16	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	^	^	^	^	
B17	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	^	^	^	^	
B18	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassassaṃ	manussassaṃ	aham	hi	bhante
B19	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasaṃ	panassassi	aham	hi	bhante
B20	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassassaṃ	panassassaṃ	aham	hi	bhante
Be	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassasaṃ	panassasaṃ	aham	hi	bhante
C01	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassānaṃ	...pe...	aham	hi	bhante
C02	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassānaṃ	...pe...	aham	hi	bhante
C03	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	sattāham	bhante	anassātaṃ	...pe...	aham	hi	bhante
C04	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsīṃ	...pe...	aham	hi	bhante
C05	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassātaṃ	...pe...	aham	hi	bhante
Ce	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	^	panassassaṃ	ahañ	hi	bhante
Ee	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsīṃ	^	ahañ	hi	bhante
K17	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsāṃ	^	aham	hi	bhante
K18	vutte	aññatarā	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	^	{ma}nassāsāṃ	aham	^	bhante
K19	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	^	manassāsāṃ	aham	^	bhante
K20	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^
K21	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavo	etthāham	bhante	anassāsāṃ	^	aham	hi	bhante
K22	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāya	...la...	aham	pi	bhante
Se	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	^	panassāsāṃ	aham	hi	bhante
T10	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavanta	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsāṃ etthāham bhante	passasaṃ	aha	ñhi	bhante
T11	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsāṃ etthāham bhante	passāsaṃ	ahañ	hi	bhante
T12	vutte	a<-pa>ññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anassāsāṃ etthāham bhante	passasaṃ	ahañ	ci	bhante
T13	vutte	aññataro	bhikkhu	bhagavantam	etadavoca	etthāham	bhante	anā {sā} yaṃ etthāham bhante	passasaṃ	aham	ñhi	bhante
T14	vutte	aññattaro	bhikkhu	bhaggavantam	etadavoca	ethāham	bhante	anassāsāṃ etthā bhante anassāsāṃ etthāham bhante	{pa}ssasaṃ	ahañ	hi	bhante

### 3. Commentary

3.1 Spk (B<sup>e</sup>) III 15; (C<sup>e</sup>) III 11; (E<sup>e</sup>) II 369; (S<sup>e</sup>) III 21-22

para.	Edition	Explanation
71	B <sup>e</sup>	etthāhaṃ bhante anassasan ti bhante ahaṃ ettha anassasiṃ naṭṭho nāma ahan ti vadati.
	C <sup>e</sup>	etthāhaṃ bhante anassāsin ti bhante ahaṃ ettha anassasiṃ naṭṭho nāma ahan ti vadati.
	E <sup>e</sup>	etthāhaṃ bhante anassāsin ti bhante ahaṃ ettha assāssa-naṭṭho nāma ahan ti vadati.
	S <sup>e</sup>	etthāhaṃ bhante anassāsan ti bhante ahaṃ ettha anassāsiṃ, naṭṭho nāma ahan ti vadati.
72	B <sup>e</sup>	anassasan ti nassasiṃ naṭṭho nāmamhi icc eva attho.
	C <sup>e</sup>	anassāsin ti nassāsiṃ naṭṭho nāma āsin ti attho.
	E <sup>e</sup>	anassāsin ti assāssa-naṭṭho nāma icchā-naṭṭho.
	S <sup>e</sup>	panassāsan ti panasmim naṭṭho nāma namhiceva attho.
73	B <sup>e</sup>	anassasan ti naṭṭho, panassasan ti atinaṭṭho.
	C <sup>e</sup> E <sup>e</sup>	panass'assan ti panaṭṭho assaṃ atinaṭṭho.
	S <sup>e</sup>	anassāsan ti apananaṭṭho. panassāsan ti atinaṭṭho.

### 3. Commentary

3.2 SN-ṭ (B<sup>e</sup>) II 294

[para.73] **panassasan** ti ekamsena naṭṭho ti ayam ettha attho ti āha “**atinaṭṭho**”ti, dhurato eva naṭṭho ti attho.



## 4. Etymology

4.1 Critical Pāli Dictionary: [like akāsim̐ ?]

**a-nassāsim̐**, *aor. 1 sg. (perhaps for anasāsim̐)*,  
SN IV 43,17 *foll.* (= natṭho aham̐, Spk); *see* nassati.

4.2 Other possibilities

[Spk E<sup>e</sup> para.72] **anassāsin̐ ti, assāsa-natṭho nāma, icchā-natṭho**

- **anassāsim̐** = *an-asso* + āsim̐ (*aor. 1 sg. √as*);

*an-assa* = skt. na + āśā + ya (taddhita affix);

āśā [=icchā] + ya >> assa ?

---

- In B<sup>e</sup> **anassasam̐** = a + √naś + ya + s + am̐ (*aor. 1 sg.*)

*But para.72 does not has mss. witness.*

---

- In B<sup>e</sup> C<sup>e</sup> Commentary of para.71,

**anassasim̐** = a + √naś + ya + s + im̐ (*aor. 1 sg.*)



## 4. Etymology

ti, avutthaṇ. *Ārakā* ti, dūre. *Etthāhaṇ*, bhante, *anassāsīn* ti, 'bhante, ahaṇ ettha assāssa-naṭṭho<sup>1</sup> nāma ahan' ti vadati.

- In E<sup>e</sup> Commentary of para.71, assāssa = skt. āśvāsyā ?

MW Skt-Eng Dict: **ā-śvāsyā**, mfn. to be acquiesced in *Megh.*

*anassāsīn* ti, assāsa-naṭṭho nāma, icchā-naṭṭho

- In E<sup>e</sup> Commentary of para.72, assāsa = skt. āśvāsa ?

MW Skt-Eng Dict: **ā-śvāsa**, m. breathing again or freely, taking breath; recovery *Suśr.*; cheering up, consolation ; relying on *Kathās.*

panass' assan<sup>4</sup> ti, panaṭṭho assaṇ, atinaṭṭho.

- panassassam = panasso + assam (*opt.* 1 *sg.* √*as*);

panassa = skt. pra + nāśyā ?

MW Skt-Eng Dict: **nāśyā**, mfn. liable to be destroyed or removed or banished

## 5. Some remarks

5.1 All mss. and P<sup>e</sup> support para.71 has reading **a**, but doesn't has reading **p**.

5.2 In commentary of para.72, B<sup>e</sup> C<sup>e</sup> E<sup>e</sup> have lemma **a**, but don't have lemma **p**.  
And reading **a** appears in many mss. of para.72.

5.3 In all printed editions of the commentary, a lemma **p** occurs in the commentary of para.73. [Including SN-ṭ (B<sup>e</sup>)]

5.4 In commentary of para.73, C<sup>e</sup> & E<sup>e</sup> don't have lemma **a**; but B<sup>e</sup> & S<sup>e</sup> have lemma **a**. And the reading **a** appears in many mss. of para.73.

5.5 Readings “*anassāsīm*” and “*panassassam*” quite have some explanations about etymology, and have mss. witness.

5.6 Try to select: (two ways)

para.	71	72	73
reading 1 (Mss.)**	anassāsīm	anassāsīm	anassāsīm panassassam
reading 2 (Comm. C <sup>e</sup> E <sup>e</sup> )	anassāsīm	anassāsīm	panassassam